



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 25

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Monday, April 10, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 225 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 320 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 265 Edmonton and Spruce Grove residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 254 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 261 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 251 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 286 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 1,300 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 323 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 257 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 386 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 222 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 269 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 275 Calgary residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 511 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier:

Letter dated April 7, 2000, from The Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, in response to Mr. Klein's letter of April 4, 2000 (Sessional Paper 437/2000), stating that Hon. Allan Rock, Federal Minister of Health, will be writing a letter to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, proposing amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 541/2000

Calgary Herald article dated April 9, 2000, entitled "MacBeth started billing for upgrades"
Sessional Paper 542/2000

Order in Council 211/92, establishing the Hospitalization Benefits Amendment Regulation
Sessional Paper 543/2000

Letter dated April 5, 2000, from Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, to Dr. Sandra Thomson, Provincial Archivist, requesting that all ministerial records during her tenure as Minister of Health be transferred to the Provincial Archives with a 15 year restriction on public access

Sessional Paper 544/2000

Letter dated April 10, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to The Right Honourable Jean Chrétien, Prime Minister, expressing disappointment on Mr. Tommy Banks' recent appointment to the Senate rather than Mr. Bert Brown or Mr. Ted Morton, and urging him to reconsider his position on this matter

Sessional Paper 545/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Letter dated April 10, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to Allan Rock, Federal Minister of Health, with attachments, addressing concerns Mr. Rock has expressed regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 546/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, pursuant to the Regional Health Authorities Act, cR-9.07, s13(3) (Alta. Reg. 286/94):

Alberta Mental Health Board, Annual Report 1998-1999

Sessional Paper 547/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Alberta Cancer Board, Annual Report 1998/99

Sessional Paper 548/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated April 4, 2000, from Rev. Dr. George H. Rodgers, United Church of Canada, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, requesting that Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act be withdrawn

Sessional Paper 549/2000

Letter dated April 5, 2000, from John Boulter, Sherwood Park, unaddressed, expressing concerns, and asking questions regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 550/2000

Letter dated March 29, 2000, from Brigham Y. Card, to Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, with attached Lethbridge Herald articles, regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 551/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter dated April 4, 2000, from Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, with an attachment, requesting clarification of the Premier's response dated April 4, 2000, to Mrs. MacBeth's request in the Legislative Assembly on April 4, 2000, for information on the Government's policy regarding contracting out medical services

Sessional Paper 552/2000

Response to Written Question WQ149 (Sessional Paper 149/95) regarding access by Albertans to MRIs (magnetic resonance imaging)

Sessional Paper 553/2000

Discussion paper dated February 14, 1991, entitled "Ambulatory Care Services in Alberta" prepared by Research and Planning Branch, Alberta Health

Sessional Paper 554/2000

Order in Council 211/92, establishing the Hospitalization Benefits Amendment Regulation

Sessional Paper 555/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated October 7, 1999, from S.J. Brodie, Edmonton, to Hon. Dr. Oberg, Minister of Learning, responding to recommendations to the MLAs' (Members of the Legislative Assembly) report on the School Council Review and commenting on the overall condition of the Learning Department

Sessional Paper 556/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Report dated September 1998, entitled "Child Health and Family Socioeconomic Status in the Canadian National Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth" prepared by Martin D. Dooley, McMaster University, and Lori Curtis, Dalhousie University

Sessional Paper 557/2000

Report dated November 1999, entitled "The Changing Nature of Home Care and Its Impact on Women's Vulnerability to Poverty" prepared by Marika Morris, Jane Robinson, Janet Simpson, Sherry Galey, Sandra Kirby, Lise Martin, Martha Muzychka, all of the Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women (CRIAOW)

Sessional Paper 558/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message from Edwina Staples of Grande Cache and an e-mail message from an unnamed sender to Members of the Legislative Assembly expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 559/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

3 letters from Aric Storck, Calgary, and Lisa Young and David Biggin-Pound, both of Canmore, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Development Corporation's proposed development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country
Sessional Paper 560/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Concert program for the Cadet Honour Band of Prairie Region's presentation of "Welcome to the 21st Century" performed at the Jubilee Auditorium on April 6, 2000

Sessional Paper 561/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated March 31, 2000, from Don and Anita Loowell, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and non-support of the Government that supports this Bill

Sessional Paper 562/2000

Health Sciences Association of Alberta Challenger article dated March 2000, entitled "If it Walks Like a Duck, and Talks Like a Duck, It's Probably a Duck" expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 563/2000

Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West:

Report entitled "Seniors Advisory Council for Alberta, 1998-1999 Year In Review"

Sessional Paper 564/2000

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Letter dated April 6, 2000, from Elizabeth Denham, Calgary Regional Health Authority, to Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, responding to Ms Leibovici's request of February 14, 2000, for access to proposals submitted by the Health Resources Group or Health Resources Centre relative to the contracting out of insured services

Sessional Paper 565/2000

Recognitions

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre: Volunteer Week, April 9-15, 2000, the efforts of the Edmonton and Calgary Volunteer Centres, and the advocacy and policy roles of the Volunteer Alberta and Volunteer Canada organizations

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods: Mill Woods Presidents' Council, comprised of the presidents of the Mill Woods, Ellerslie, and Mill Creek community leagues, and established to promote services and respond to community needs

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning: Cadet Honour Band of Prairie Region and the their performance of "Welcome to the 21st Century" at the Jubilee Auditorium, April 6, 2000

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

A debate followed.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, moved that the motion be amended by deleting all the words after "that" and substituting the following:

Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, be not now read a Second time but that the Order for Second Reading be discharged, the Bill withdrawn and the subject-matter be referred to the Standing Committee on Law and Regulations.

Debate adjourned on amendment, Mr. Bonner speaking.

Adjournment

The Assembly adjourned at 5:30 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

MONDAY, APRIL 10, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

Debate continued (on amendment introduced by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, on April 10, 2000) that the motion be amended by deleting all the words after "that" and substituting the following:

Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, be not now read a Second time but that the Order for Second Teading be discharged, the Bill withdrawn and the subject-matter be referred to the Standing Committee on Law and Regulations.

The question being put, with Mrs. Gordon in the Chair, the amendment was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 7

Bonner	Leibovici	Sloan
Carlson	MacDonald	Wickman
Gibbons		

Against the amendment: 31

Amery	Kryczka	Severtson
Broda	Laing	Stelmach
Cao	Magnus	Stevens
Clegg	Mar	Strang
Coutts	Marz	Taylor
Ducharme	McClellan	Thurber
Havelock	McFarland	Trynchy
Herard	Melchin	Woloshyn
Hlady	Oberg	Yankowsky
Jonson	Paszkowski	Zwozdesky
Klapstein		

Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that this question be now put, pursuant to Standing Order 47(1).

A debate followed.

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, moved adjournment of the Assembly. The question being put, with Mrs. Gordon in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 29

Amery	Kryczka	Stelmach
Broda	Laing	Stevens
Cao	Magnus	Strang
Clegg	Marz	Taylor
Coutts	McClellan	Thurber
Ducharme	McFarland	Trynchy
Havelock	Melchin	Woloshyn
Hlady	Oberg	Yankowsky
Jonson	Paszkowski	Zwozdesky
Klapstein	Severtson	

Against the motion: 11

Blakeman	Leibovici	Sapers
Bonner	MacBeth	Sloan
Carlson	MacDonald	Soetaert
Gibbons	Massey	

The Assembly adjourned at 11:28 p.m. until Tuesday, April 11, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Monday, April 10, 2000